

8]Y`ÿfnhY`]b`6Yf`]b.`; YÄbXYfhYg
Gci bX_cbnYdh`ZØf`Y]gYfYg`? cbnYfh

8]Y`ÿfnhY`gd]Y`Yb`XfY]`C dYb!5]f!`? cbnYfhY`]b`6Yf`]b`ž`XcWx`]b
X]YgYa`'š\`f`[]Vh`Yg`ÿbXYfi b[Yb`]a`'Gci bX_cbnYdh`ž`i a
5bk c\`bYf`ni`'gWxØhnYb`"9fZU\`fYb`G]Y`a`Y\`f`



8]Y': Ubg'XYf'6UbX'8]Y'ÿfnhY'k UfhYb'VYfY]hg'[YgdUbbh'Ui ZX]Y
_ca a YbXYb'XfY]'CdYb!5]f!?'cbnYfhY'Ua 'HYa dY'\cZYf': Y'X'jb
6Yf'jb''8]YgY'J YfUbgH'hi b[Yb'j YfgdfYW'Yb'Y]b'a i g]_U`]gW'Yg
: Yi Yfk Yf'_a]h'U''XYb'VY'_UbbhYb'<]hgž'gck c'\`XYb''Ui hghUf'_Yb
U'g'Ui W'X'Yb''Y]gYfYb'?`Àb[Ybž'X]Y'X]Y'?i`hVUbX'j]b'XYb''YhnhYb
»\fnY\bhYb'j YfÖZYbh]W'h\Uh''8cW'XUg'?cbnYfh'Ub'X]YgYa
\]ghcf]gW'Yb'Ch'Vf]b[h'b]W'h'bi f': fYi XY'a]h'g]W'/Yg'[]Vh'Ui W
VYXYi hYbXY'ÿbXYfi b[Ybž'X]Y'X]Y'5bk c\bYf'i bX'X]Y'J YfUbgH'hYf
VYhfYZYb"

»XYf'J Yf[Ub[Yb\Y]h'gcf[hYb'X]Y'CdYb!5]f!?'cbnYfhY'Ui Z'XYa
HYa dY'\cZYf': Y'X'ZØf'[fc»Y'5i ZFY[i b["K À\fybX'Y]bYg'5i Zhf]hgg
j cf'nk Y]»\fYb'[UV'Yg'nU'\fY]W'Y'6YgW'k YfXYb'j cb'5bk c\bYfbž
X]Y'Ub[UVYbž'XUgg'X]Y'A i g]_j]Y''ni ''Ui hi bX'ghÖfYbX'[Yk YgYb
gY]''5i W'j]b'X]YgYa '»\f'k]fX'Yg'k]YXYf'?cbnYfhY'[YVYbž'UVYf'X]Y
J YfUbhk cfh]W'Yb'\UVYb'A U»bU\ a Yb'Yf[f]ZYbž'i a 'X]Y
@Ui hghÀf'_Y'XYf'A i g]_ni 'fY[i 'YfYb'i bX'gca]h'XYb'5bk c\bYfb
Ybh[Y[Ybni _ca a Yb"

A U» bU\ a Yb'ni f'@Àfa fYXi _h]cb

I a 'X]Y'@Àfa VY'Àgh][i b['k À\fybX'XYf'?cbnYfhY'ni 'a]b]a]YfYbž
\Uh'X]Y'GYbUhgj Yfk U'hi b['Y[YbØVYf' fVV&('_Uf'[Ya UW'hž
XUgg'X]Y'@Ui hghÀf'_Y'j]b'XYf'B UW'VUfgW'UZh'k À\fybX'XYf'5i Zhf]hgh
+ \$'8Yn]VY''b]W'h'ØVYfgW'fY]hYb'XUfZ''I a 'g]W'Yfni ghY''Ybž'XUgg
X]YgYg'@ja]h'Y]b[Y\U'hYb'k]fXž'k YfXYb'j cf'XYb'?cbnYfhYb
XYhU]''YfhY'GW'U''a Yggi b[Yb'Xi fW [YZØ\fh''GdYn]U'ghYbž
XUfi bhYf'5_i gh]_Yfž'j Yfk YbXYb'Y]b'' 8!A cXY''ž'i a 'ni
UbU'mg]YfYbž'k]Y'g]W'XYf'GW'U''i bhYf'6YfØW_g]W'h][i b['XYf
Öfh]W'Yb'; Y[YVYb\Y]hYb'Ui gVfY]hYh"

8]YgY'dfÅj Ybh]j Yb'A U» bU\ a Yb'g]bX'bc'hk YbX][ž'i a 'ja 'J cfUi g
\YfUi gni Z]bXYbž'k]Y''Ui h'X]Y'A i g]_Ui ZX'Yf'6Ø\bY'gY]b'XUfZ'c\bY
X]Y'ZYgh[Y'Y[hYb'Bcfa Yb'j]b'XYb'K c\b[YV]YhYb'ni 'j Yf'YhYb"
@Ui h'XYf'GYbUhgj Yfk U'hi b['\UVYb'Ui W'X]Y'J YfUbgH'hYf'fYU[]Yfhž
]bXYa 'g]Y'XUg'@Ui hgdYfW'Yf'_cbnYdh'YbhgdYfW'YbX'Ub[YdUggh

\UVYb"8]Y'J YfUbgH'hyf' [YVYb'Ubž'XUgg'g]Y'ZØf'XUg'; Y'ÀbXY'Y]b
Ui g[Y_Ø[Y'hYg'Gci bX_cbnYdh'Ybhk]W_Y'h\UVYbž'XUg'X]Y
@Àfa Ya]gg]cbYb'_cbhfc''Yfhi bX'jbbYf\U'V'XYf' [YbY\ a] [hYb
F U\ a YbVYX]b[i b[Yb'V'Y]Vh"

< YfUi gZcfXYfi b[Yb'Ua 'HYa dY'\cZYf': Y'X

8 Ug'HYa dY'\cZYf': Y'Xž'XUg'g]W'Ui ZXYa ' ; Y'ÀbXY'XYg
Y\Ya U'] [Yb': 'i [\UZYbg'VYZ]bXYhž'\Uh'Xi fW'gY]bY'6Ui k Y]gY'i bX
; Y [YVYb\Y]hYb'Y]bY'VYgcbXYfY'U_i gh]gW'Y'< YfUi gZcfXYfi b["
6YgcbXYfg'i'Ui h'g]bX'?cbnYfhYž'X]Y'X]fY_h'Ua ' ; YVÀi XY'XYg
Y\Ya U'] [Yb': 'i [\UZYbg'ghUhhZ]bXYb"<]Yf'k]fX'XYf'@Àfa 'j]b
F]W'hi b['D'Uhn'XYf'@ ZhVfØW_Y'Xi fW'X]Y'Ghfi _hi f'XYg'; YVÀi XYg
nk Uf'Yf\YV']W' [Ya]bXYfh''5i ZXYf'UbXYfYb'GY]hY'YXcW
fYZY_h]Yfh'XUg'< Ui dh[YVÀi XY'XYb'GW'U''k]Y'Y]b'DUfUVc'gd]Y [Y'
i bX'_Ubb'X]Y '@Ui hghÀf_Y']b'UbXYfY'F]W'hi b[Yb'j YfghÀf_Yb"
9i dYfhYb'k]Y' a a]gg]cbggW'i hnYi dYfhY'Øf['?YddYf'k Y]gYb
XUfUi Z\]bž'XUgg'X]YgY'5_i gh]'VYgcbXYfg'ZØf'X]Y'i a 'Y] [YbXYb
5bk c\ bYf'j cb'6YXYi hi b['gh"

8 Yf'J YfUbgH'hyf'\Uh'VYhc b hž'XUgg'X]Y'5bdUggi b[Yb'Ub'XYa
@Ui hgdYfW'YfUi ZVUi 'j cf[Ybca a Yb'k i fXYbž'i a 'X]Y
5i gk]f_i b[Yb'Ui ZX]Y'5bk c\ bYf'gc' [Yf]b['k]Y'a Ø[']W'ni
\U'hYb"8i fW'X]YgY'_cb_fYhYb'A U» bU\ a Yb'\cZYb'U''Y
6YhY'] [hYbž'XUgg'X]Y'?cbnYfhY'b]W'h'bi f'Y]b'j c''Yf'9fZc'['ZØf'8]Y
YfnhY'i bX']\fY': Ub'g'g]bXž'gcbXYfb'XUgg'Ui W'X]Y'B UW'VUfgW'UZh
b]W'hi bhYf'XYb'?Àb[Yb'XYf'A i g]_''Y]XYh"

8]Y' [fc» Y'J cfZfYi XY'Ui ZX]Y'5i Zhf]hY'XYf'6Ub'X'k]fX'Xi fW'X]Y
bYi Yb'A U» bU\ a Yb'VY['Y]hYhž'X]Y'gck c\''XYb'; ÀghYb'U'g'Ui W
XYb'5bk c\ bYfb'ni [i hY_ca a Yb'gc''Yb"8Ua]h'gc'' [Yk À\ f'Y]ghYh
k YfXYbž'XUgg'Y]b'\Ufa cb]gW'Yg'A]hY]bUbXYf'nk]gW'Yb': Y]YfbXYb
i bX'XYb'ja 'l a ZY'X''YVYbXYb'A YbgW'Yb'YbhghY\h''J cf'U''Ya 'X]Y
9f\Ø\i b['XYf'J YfUbhk cfhi b['XYf'J YfUbgH'hyf'i bX'X]Y'ghÀf_YfY
9]bV]bXi b['j cb'A U» bU\ a Yb'ni f'@Àfa fYXi n]Yfi b['g]bX'GW'f]hYž
X]Y']b'Ni _i bZ'h'a Ø[']W'Yfk Y]gY'Ui W'VY]'À\ b']W'Yb
J YfUbgH'hi b[Yb'Y]bY' [fc» Y'F c''Y'gd]Y'Yb'_ØbbhYb" 'A]h'X]YgYb
5bdUggi b[Yb'nY][h'g]W'ž'XUgg'Ui W'VY]' [fc» Yb'9j Ybhg'XYf'8]U'c [

a]h'XYf'l a [YVi b['i bX'XUg'GhfYVYb' bUW\ 'Y]bYa 'fYgdY_hj c``Yb
A]hY]bUbXYf'ja 'J cfXYf[fi bX'ghY\Yb '_ÖbbYb"

8]Y'8]g_i gg]cb'ØVYf'X]Y '@Àfa VY`Àgh][i b['VY]'C dYb!5]f! ? cbnYfhYb
]gh'b]W\h'bi f'Y]b ``c_U'Yg'D\Àbca Ybž'gcbXYfb'VYhf]Z]h'j]Y`Y '[fc» Y
GhÀXhY'k Y'hk Y]h"``Y\`b`]W\Y'?cbZ]_hY'hfUhYb'VY]gd]Y'gk Y]gY']b
<Ua Vi f['Ui Z'k c`X]Y`À\`f]W\Yb'?cbnYfhY'ja 'GhUXhdUf_]a a Yf
k]YXYf']b`XYf'?f]h]_`ghY\Yb"6Yk c\`bYf'XYf'i a `]Y[YbXYb
K c\`b[YV]YhY' _U[hYb'\`Ài Z]['ØVYf'@Àfa 'i bX'Y]b[YgW\ fÀb_hY
BUW\ hfi \Y"5i W\` \Yf'\UVYb'X]Y'J YfUbghU'hYf'A U» bU\`a Yb
Yf[f]ZYbž'i a `XYb'@Àfa 'k À\`fYbX'XYf'?cbnYfhY'ni `a]b]a]YfYb
i bX'Y]b`Ubkc\`bYfZfYi bX`]W\Yg'?cbnYdh'ni `Yb'hk]W_Y`b"

9]b'6Y]gd]Y`XUZØf']gh'XUg' @Àfa gW\i hn_cbnYdh `XYf'<Ua Vi f[Yf
6Y\`ÖfXY`ZØf'l a k Y'h'i bX'9bYf[]Yž'k Y`W\Yg'X]Y '@Ui hghÀf_Y
k À\`fYbX'XYf'?cbnYfhY'Ui ZY]b`U_nYdhUV`Yg'B]j YUi `VYgW\ fÀb_h
i bX'Ui »YfXYa `fY[Y`a À»][Y`A Yggi b[Yb'j c'fgW\ fY]Vhž'i a `X]Y
9]b\U`hi b[`XYf'; fYbnk YfhY'g]W\Yfni ghY``Yb"8]YgY
J cf[Y\Yb'gk Y]gY`nY][hž'XUgg'J YfUbghU'hYf'i bX'6Y\`ÖfXYb
ni bY\`a YbX'j Yf'gi W\Ybž'Y]b'; `Y]W\ [Yk]W\h'nk]gW\Yb`_i `hi fY``Yb
J YfUbghU`hi b[Yb'i bX'XYb'6YXØfZb]ggYb`XYf'5bk c\`bYf'ni `Z]bXYb"

@Àfa gW\i hn'i bX'HYW\bc`c []Y

8]Y'HYW\bc`c []Yb'ni f'@Ui hghÀf_Y_cbhfc``Y`\UVYb'g]W\]b`XYb
`YhnhYb` \Y\`fYb'ghUf`_k Y]hYfYb'hk]W_Y`h"6Y]j]Y`Yb` [fc» Yb
J YfUbghU`hi b[Yb'k]fX'a]h`Yfk Y]Y`Ui Z'a cXYfbY
GW\U`a Ygg[YfÀhY'i bX'GcZhk UfY'ni f`U_i gh]gW\Yb'D`Ubi b[
ni fØW_[Y[f]ZYb"8]YgY'GmghYa Y`Yfa Ö[`]W\Yb`Y]bY'dfÀn]gY
GhYi Yfi b[`XYf'@Ui hghÀf_Y'gck]Y`X]Y'5bdUggi b[`XYf
GW\U`j YfhY]i b[`Y`bUW\`GhUjXcf'hi bX'6YgW\UZYb\Y]h'XYg
; Y`ÀbXYg"

8 UfØVYf`\]bUi g'gYhnYb`Y]b][Y'J YfUbghU'hYf'Ui Z
GW\U`gW\i hnk ÀbXY`i bX' @Ui hgdFYW\Yf!5ffUmg ž'i a `XYb'GW\U`
[Yn]Y'h]b`X]Y`F]W\hi b[`XYg'Di V`_i a g'ni ``Y]hYb'i bX'FYZY_h]cbYb
ni `a]b]a]YfYb"6Y\`W\Y`A U» bU\`a Yb'g]bX'VYgcbXYfg'k]W\h][`]b
i fVUbYb'; YV]YhYbž'k c`X]Y`Ghfi _hi f`XYf'i a `]Y[YbXYb'; YVÀi XY

XYb`GWU`j YfghÀf_Yb`cXYf`UbXYfg`fYZY_h]YfYb`_Ubb"8Yf`9]bgUhn
X]YgYf`HYWbc`c []Yb`_ÒbbhY`ØVYf`X]Y`_ca a YbXYb`À\fy`)\bk Y [
XUni`ZØ\fybž`XUgg`; fc»j YfUbghU`hi b [Yb`ZØf`5bk c\bYf`k Yb][Yf
ghØfYbX`g]bXž`k À\fybX`X]Y`6Ygi W`Yf`XYbbcW`Y]b
i bj Yf [Ygg]W`Yg`?cbnYfhYf`YVb]g` [Yb]Y»Yb`_ÒbbYb"

F YW`h`]W`Y`F U`a YbVYX]b [i b [Yb`i b X
J YfUbghU`hYfj YfUbhk c fhi b [

⇒8Yi hgW`UbX` []Vh`Yg`gdYn]Z]gW`Y` [YgYhn`]W`Y
F U`a YbVYX]b [i b [Ybž`X]Y`XYb`@Àfa gW`i hn`VY]J YfUbghU`hi b [Yb
fY [Y`b"8]Y` &"6-a GW`J`fU`YfcfXbi b [`ØVYf`X]Y
; YgUa h`Àfa a]bXYfi b [E`VYgW`fY]Vh`X]Y`ni`Àgg][Yb`@Àfa dY [Y`ZØf
j YfgW`]YXYbY`5fhYb`j cb`J YfUbghU`hi b [Yb`i b X`XYfYb
8i fW`ZØ\fi b ["J YfUbghU`hYf`g]bX` [YgYhn`]W`j YfdZ]W`hYhž
6Uff]YfYb`ni`gW`UZZYbž`X]Y`gck c`XYb`@Àfa`ZØf`X]Y`5bk c\bYf
_cbhfc`]YfYb`U`g`Ui W`X]Y`G]W`Yf`Y]h`XYf`; ÀghY` [Yk À\fy]ghYb"

K Ybb`5bk c\bYf`@Àfa VYgW`k YfXYb`Y]bFY]W`Ybž`_ÒbbYb`X]YgY`ni
; Y`XVi »Yb`ZØf`X]Y`J YfUbghU`hYf`ZØ\fybž`k Ybb`X]YgY`X]Y
ZYgh [Y`Y [hYb`; fYbnk YfhY`ØVYfgW`fY]hYb"9]b`6Y]gd]Y`Ui`g`XYf
DfUI]g`]gh`Y]b` : Ygh]j U`]b`A ØbW`Ybž`k Y`W`Yg`Ui Z [fi bX`j cb
k]YXYf`c`hYb`6YgW`k YfXYb`XYf`5bk c\bYf`gY]bY`@Ui hghÀf`_Y
XfUgh]gW`fYXi n]YfYb`i bX` [`Y]W`nY]h] [`X]Y`Ni`gW`Ui`Yfg]hi`Uh]cb`Ui`Z
XYa` ; Y`ÀbXY`cd]a]YfYb`a`i`gghY" `Gc`W`Y`fYW`h`]W`Yb
F U`a YbVYX]b [i b [Yb`nY][Ybž`k]Y`k]W`h][`Y]b`fYgdY`_hj`c`Yg
A]hY]bUbXYf`nk]gW`Yb`J YfUbghU`hYf`bž`5bk c\bYf`i bX`6Y`ØfXYb
]gh"

· · B 5;

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W`Yb`G]Y`i`bg`Ui`Z.`a`Y]b!VYf`]b"bYh