

ÿ f[Yf']b`A]`ck `ØVYf'[Yd`UbhY`l a `Y]hi b[
i bX`XfY]Y]b\ U`V`>U\ fY`6Ui nY]h`XYf
: f]YXYbgghfU» Y

5i gVUi `XYf': f]YXYbgghfU» Y`b`A]`ck ` `ÿ f[Yf'ØVYf'[Yd`UbhY
l a `Y]hi b[`9g`VfcXY`h]b`A]`ck `"; fi bX`XUZØf']gh`XYf'[Yd`UbhY
5i gVUi `XYf`CfhgXi fWZU\fh`Nk Uf`k i fXY`X]YgYf`Ub[Yg]W\hg
XYg`gW`YW`hYb`Ni ghUbXg`XYf': f]YXYbgghfU» Y`i bX`XYf
XUni [Y\Øf][Yb`; Y\k Y[Y`j cb`j]Y`Yb`A YbgW`Yb`gW`cb`Ub[Y
\YfVY][YgY\bh`BUW`XYf`J YfÖZYbh]W`i b[`Y]bYf
DfYggYa]hhY]`i b[`XYg`@UbXYgVYhf]YVg`GhfU» Ybk YgYb`]gh`bi b
UVYf`X]Y`J Yfi bg]W`Yfi b[`]b`XYf`6Yj Ö`_Yfi b[`[fc» "'8]Y`]b
XYf`A]hhY]`i b[`Ub[Y[YVYbY`j cfUi gg]W`h]W`Y`6Ui nY]h`j cb
XfY]Y]b\ U`V`>U\ fYbž`X]Y`[Yd`UbhY`l a `Y]hi b[`i bX`XUg`V]g\Yf
j Yf[YV`]W`Y`K UfhYb`Ui ZY]bY`5bk c\bYfj YfgUa a`i b[
gcf[Yb`ZØf`YXY`A Yb[Y`: fi gh" `6Y]`i bg`k]fX`gh`AbX][`ØVYf
X]YgYg`H\Ya U`X]g_i h]Yfh"8]Y`@Yi hY`ZFU[Yb`a]W`]a a Yf
k]YXYfž`k Y]`g]Y`/ Ua d^Y`]d/



5i gVUi `XYf': f]YXYbgghfU» Y`b`A]`ck ` `ÿ f[Yf'ØVYf'[Yd`UbhY

I a `Y]hi b[

9g`VfcXY`h]b`A]`ck " ; fi bX`XUZ0f`]gh`XYf`[Yd`UbhY`5i gVUi `XYf
C fhgXi fW\ZU\fh" `Nk Uf`k i fXY`X]YgYf`Ub[Yg]W\hg`XYg`gW`YW\hYb
Ni ghUbXg`XYf` : f]YXYbgghfU» Y`i bX`XYf`XUni [Y\0f][Yb` ; Y\k Y[Y
j cb`j]Y`Yb`A YbgW\Yb`gW\cb`Ub[Y`YfVY][YgY`bh" BUW`XYf
J Yf0ZZYbh]W\i b[`Y]bYf`DfYggYa]hhY]i b[`XYg`@UbXYgVYhf]YVg
GhfU» Ybk YgYb`]gh`bi b`UVYf`X]Y`J Yfi bg]W\Yfi b[`]b`XYf
6Yj 0`_Yfi b[[fc» " 8]Y`]b`XYf`A]hhY]i b[`Ub[Y[YVYbY
j cfUi gg]W\h]W\Y`6Ui nY]hj cb`XfY]Y]b`U`V`U\`fYbž`X]Y`[Yd`UbhY
I a `Y]hi b[`i bX`XUg`V]g\Yf`j Yf[YV`]W\Y`K UfhYb`Ui ZY]bY
5bk c`bYfj YfgUa a `i b[`gcf[Yb`Z0f`YXY`A Yb[Y` : fi gh"

6Y]i bg`k]fX`ghAbX][`0VYf`X]YgYg`H\Ya U`X]g_i h]Yfh"8]Y`@Yi hY
ZfU[Yb`a]W`]a a Yf`k]YXYfž`k Y`]g]Y`k]ggYbž`XUgg`]W\
; Ya Y]bXYj YfhfYhYf`V]bž`k Ubb`Yg`YbX`]W`a]h`XYb`6Ui UfVY]hYb
`cg[Y`h ž`VYf]W\hYh`< Ufha i h`<0VYbYf`i bX`a UW\h`XYi h]W\` 8]Y
A YbgW\Yb`g]bX`j Yfi bg]W\Yfi bX`gUi Yfž`k Y`]X]Y
9]bk c`bYfgUa a `i b[`bcW`b]W\h`ghUhh[YZ] bXYb`U`hž`bi b`UVYf
Y]bY`DfYggY]bZcfa Uh]cb`]b`XYf`K Y`h]gh" `G]Y`VfUi W\Yb`Yhnh
=bZcfa Uh]cbYbž`X]Y`< UbX`i bX` : i » `UVYb"

K Y`]Yg`X]YgY`V]g`Ub[`b]W\h`[UVž`]gh`bUW`J Yf0ZZYbh]W\i b[`XYf
DfYggYa]hhY]i b[`XYg`@UbXYgVYhf]YVg`GhfU» Ybk YgYb`Ui Z`XYf
 : UW`Vcc`!GY]hY` I bgYf`@YVYb`]a `A]`ck Yf`@UbX`Y]bY`\]hn][Y
8]g_i gg]cb`YbhghUbXYb" 7\Ucg`j cfdfc[fUa a]Yfh ž`a Y]bhY]b
 : UW`Vcc`I gYfž`XYf`Ub`XYf` : f]YXYbgghfU» Y`k c`bh`i bX`gW\fy]Vh
XUni . . ž) `U\`fY` `k c`g]bX`X]Y` : UW`_f`Z`hY`3`Gc`Y]bY`k]W\h][Y
GhfU» Yž`Ni Vf]b[Yf`ni f`5i hcVU`bž`a 0ggghY`]b`_0fnYghYf`NY]h[YVUi h
k YfXYb" `5VYf`XUg`UVYb`k]f`U`gW\cb`VY]XYf`6f0W_Y`i bX`XYa
YfghYb`?fY]gY`[YgY`Yb" `C`bY`K`cfhY"

9]bY`UbXYfY`I gYf]b`V`]W_h`VYgcf[h`Ui Z`X]Y`VYj c fghY`YbXY
6Ui d`UgY. `W`k YfXY`U`gc`XfY]`U\`fY`Ub[ž`gYW\g`HU[Y`X]Y
K cW\Yž`Z0f`Y]bYb`5fVY]hgk Y[`(&?)`ca YhYf`ni f0W`_Y[Yb`a 0ggYbž
i a `XUbb` (ž) `Ghi bXYb`ni `UfVY]hYb" `BU`Už`ni f0W`_a i gg`]W`U
Ui W`k]YXYfž`U`gc` , (`?)`ca YhYf`h`[`]W`" `Gca]h[Y`h`XUbb`Y]b
8f]hhY`a Y]bYg`@c`bYg`Z0f`6Ybn]b`XfUi Z" `G]Y`Zc`fXYfh`Z0f`DYbX`Yf

i bX`5bk c\bYf`]b`A]`ck `Y]bY`VYggYfY`F Y[Y`i b["

8Yb`<]bk Y]gž`XUgg`Yg`g]W`VY]`XYf`GhfYW_Y`i a `Y]bYb
5i hcVU\bni Vf]b[Yf`\UbXY`hž`_ca a Ybh]Yfh`X]Y` : UWVcc`!Bi hnYf]b
a]h`fcb]Y.` 8Yf`5i hcVU\bni Vf]b[Yf`j Yf`Äi Zh`U`cZZ]n]Y``ØVYf
DfYa b]hn`i bX`6fUbXYbVi f["K]f`V]`XYb`i bg`XYb`j]Y`Yb`J Yf`_Y`f
bi f`Y]b" `8Ug`gY]`Ui W`X`Yf` ; fi bX`XUZØfž`XUggž`bUW`XYa `XUg`YfghY
HY]`ghØW`_XYf`G`W`bY`ghfU»Y`@`*`fC`fhgi a [Y`i b[`5`hVYbgXcfZ
ZYfh][[YghY`h`k Ufž`XUg`nk Y]hY`HY]`ghØW`_b]W`h`[YVUi h`k i fXY"
Gcbgh`\ÄhhYb`Y`hnh`U`Y`C`fhY`nk]gW`Yb`?bcV`Ui W`i bX`A]`ck `Y]bY
C`fhgi a [Y`i b[`[Y`UVh"

8Ugg`XYf`j]Y`Y`@_k !J Yf`_Y`f`XUZØf`gc`f[hž`XUgg`<Äi`gYf`F]ggY
VY`_ca a Yb`i bX`?]bXYf`b]W`h`a Y`f`Ub`XYf`GhfU»Y`gd]Y`Yb`_ØbbYbž
g]W`X]Y`F`UXZU`fYf`]b`@YVYbg[YZU`f`VYZ]bXYbž`XUj`cb`fYXYh`_Y]bYf"
J Yfa i h`]W`k]fX`Yg`bUW` : Yfh][ghY`i b[`XYf`bYi Yb`GhfU»Y`bcW`
a Y`f`J Yf`_Y`f`Ui Z`XYf`@`*`[YVYb`ž`a i ha U»h`X]Y` : fUi "

9]b`5bk c\bYf`Ui`g`A]`ck `Ubb`ØVYf`X]Y
; YgW`k]bX][_Y]hgVYgW`fÄb`_i b[`]a `C`fh]`cb`` \$`_a`#`ZØf`@_k`bi`f
`UW`Yb.` 6YgcbXYfg`UVYbXg`fUgYb`X]Y`Y`f`Xi`fW`ž`XUgg`a`Ub`YW`h
ZUgh`Ui`g`XYa`6Yh`ZÄ`h`G`W`UXYž`XUgg`X]Y`6Øf[Yf`j`cb`A]`ck `Y]b
A]hgd`fUW`YfYW`h`\UVYb" `8Yf`A`Ubb`\Uh`gc[Uf`≠Y`Ybž`k]Y`a`Ub
XYb`8i`fW`[Ub[gj`Yf`_Y`fg`Äfa`i bX`X]Y`G]W`Yf`Y]h`\YfghY`Yb
_ØbbhY" `9]ba`U`b`UW`Gd`Ub]Yb`[YgW`Ui`hž`X]Y`\UVYb`Yg`U`g`9I
dYfZY`_h[Y`Øgh`5VYf`Y]XYf`g]bX`k]f`\]Yf`]b`8i`a`a`UbX`5`gc
k`UfhYb`k]f` ž) `J`fYž`i bX`U`Y`UW`Yb"i bX`hYi`fYf`k]fX`XUg
gc`k]Ygc"

9]bY`k Y]hYfY` : fUi`Z]bXYh`XUg`U`Yg`i bZUggVUf`" ?Y]bYf`Y]
≠Zcfa`Uh]cbYb`j`cb`XYf` ; Ya`Y]bXYž`i bX`k`Ybb`XfY]`J`fY`[YgU[h
k]fXž`g]bX`Yg`XUbb`j]Yf`V]g`ZØbZ" `9]b`5bk c\bYf`k`UfhYh`XYfk`Y]
k Y]hYf`]b`Ui`ZY]bY`9]bk c\bYf`j`YfgUa`a`i b[ž]b`XYf`X]Y
6Ui`a`U»bU`a`Yb`Yf`ØfhYfh`k`YfXYb" `≠W`gY`Y`]a`a`Yf`bi`f`X]Y
J Yfa`Yggi`b[gZ]fa`Už`[YZØ`h`gW`cb`gYW`ga`U`ž`UVYf`_Y]bY
≠Zcfa`Uh]cbYb" `Gc``]W`ni`f`5fVY]h`Z]Y[Yb3`ž`ZfU[h`XYf`A`Ubb"

J Yfk`i bXYfh]gh`Y]bY`k Y]hYfY` : UWVcc`!Bi hnYf]b.` J YfghY`\]W`XUg

f]W\h][3'8 U[Y\h'X]Y'I a`Y]hi b[]b`F]W\hi b[; Ybh\]b`ØVYf
7i l k]b_Y`i bX`?`Y]b`K i ghYfk]hnž`X]Y`gW\`]a a ghY`6i W_Y`d]ghYž`X]Y
]W\`Y`[YgY\Yb`\UV3`K Ybb`XUg`gc`gY]b`gc`hYž`[]Vh`Yg`\cZZYbh]W\
GW\UXYbgYfgUhn`ZØf`U`Y`nYfghØfhYb` : U\fk Yf_Y`bUW\`XfY]`š\`fYb
6Ui nY]h`fl` 8 Ugg`Yg`[Ya UW\hk YfXYb`a i ggž`]gh`_Y]bY` : fU[Yž
UVYf`X]Y`8Ui Yf`]gh`ÀW\Yf`]W\`"

=gh`XUg`Yfbgh`[Ya Y]bh`cXYf`]gh`XUg`Y]b`8fi W_ZY`\`Yf3 ž`k]`Y]bY
k Y]hYfY`l gYf]b`k]ggYb``9]bY`5bhk cfh`\Uh`Y]bY`UbXYfY` : fUi` 8 Ug
]gh`Yfbgh`[Ya Y]bhž`gcbgh`k ØfXY`Yg`b]W\h`XU`ghY`\Yb``GW\`]a a ž`i bX
XUg`XfY]`š\`fY`Ub[" ` ž` š\`fY`6Ui nY]h`ZØf`nk Y]`?`]`ca YhYf`GhfU`Y
i bX` ; Y\k Y[Y`_ca a Ybh]Yfh`Ya UbX`a]h` Bi f`_Y]bY`9]Y
Ui Z`_ca a Yb`UggYb`` l bX`Y]bY`UbXYfY`l gYf]b`gW\`fY]Vh` A UX`Y]b
 ; Yfa Ubm`XUi Yfh`Y]bZUW\`j]Y`ni` Ub[Y` 8]Y`A]`ck Yf]b`š]b]bU`F`U`
j Yfgi W\h`Yg`XU[Y[Yb`a]h`<i a cf`i bX`a UW\h`Y]bYb`b]W\h`[Ubn
Yfbgh`[Ya Y]bhYb`J cfgW\`U[.` J]Y`Y]W\h`gc`hYb`k]f`U`Y`Yhk Ug
a]h`Y`ZYbž`XUbb`gW\`UZYb`k]f`XUg`]b`XfY]`K cW\Yb``GW\`Yfn
VY]gY]hY ž`XUg`]gh`f]W\h][[[fc`» Y`GW\`Y]» Y`"

8Yfk Y]`\Uh`g]W\` : Y]l` A YbnY`ž`6Øf[Yfa Y]ghYf`XYf` ; Ya Y]bXY
A]`ck Yf`fGD8 8ž`Ui gZØ`\f`]W\`ni` XYb`Ub[YVfUW\`hYb`?`f]h]_di b`_hYb
[YÅi » Yfh`GY]bY`9f`_Åfi b[Yb`i bX`k Y]hYfY` 8Zcg`ni a`5i gVUi`XYf
CfhgXi fW\ZU\fh`A]`ck`YgYb`G]Y`\]Yf.`Yf[Yf`i a`CfhgXi fW\ZU\fh
A]`ck` ž` š\`fY`6Ui nY]h`i bX`l a`Y]hi b[.`6Øf[Yfa Y]ghYf`A YbnY`
_`Åfh`Ui Z`A 5N

8YhU]`g

6Ygi W\Yb`G]Y`i bg`Ui Z.`a Y]b!VYf`]b`bYh